



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Flagstaff: 3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928.679.8900 • FAX 928.779.6868 • www.naipta.az.gov
Cottonwood: 340 Happy Jack Way • Cottonwood, AZ 86326 • 928.634.2287 • FAX 928.634.1685

Board of Directors Minutes for Wednesday, September 21, 2011

NAIPTA
3773 N. Kaspar Dr.
Flagstaff, AZ 86004

NOTE: IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA BOARD MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITH QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

The Board of Directors met in Regular Session on Wednesday, September 21, 2011 at 10:00 am in the Cottonwood Room, 150 S. 6th St., Cottonwood, AZ 86326.

Public was invited to observe and participate in the meeting at the address above.

PRESENT:

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

Matt Ryan (Chair), Board of Supervisors, Coconino County;
Mike Ward, City Council, City of Sedona;
Linda Norman (Vice-Chair), City Council, City of Cottonwood;
Gene Carrigan, designee for Chip Davis, Yavapai County;
Celia Barotz (Secretary), Vice Mayor, City of Flagstaff

BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Al White, City Council, City of Flagstaff;
Richard Payne, Campus Transit/Parking Services, NAU;
*Rob Adams, Mayor, City of Sedona;
*Liz Archuleta, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County;
*Scott Overton, City Council, City of Flagstaff;
*Rich Bowen, Associate Vice President for Economic Development, NAU;
*Karen Pfeifer, Vice Mayor, City of Cottonwood

*alternates

NAIPTA STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

Jeff Meilbeck, General Manger;
Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director;
Jim Wagner, Operations Director;
Kathy Chandler, Senior Manager Paratransit;
Randy Biles, Operations Manager;
Robert Martinez, Technical Specialist;



Getting you where you want to go



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Flagstaff: 3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928.679.8900 • FAX 928.779.6868 • www.naipta.az.gov
Cottonwood: 340 Happy Jack Way • Cottonwood, AZ 86326 • 928.634.2287 • FAX 928.634.1685

Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board;
Fredda Bisman, NAIPTA Attorney

GUESTS PRESENT:

Jim Jackson, Vince Lemley, Mary Eichman, Bob Oliphant, Chris Fuller, June Hayes, Loren C. Fater, Allen Hamburger, Curt Bohall, Margaret Paddock, Richard Dehnert, Lynn Meachum, Dennis Ladd, Barbara Ladd, Michele Bradley, Trevor Gottschalk, Nancy Gottschalk, David O'Donnell, Russ Wallison, Richard Faust, Frankie Bemis, Margaret Frets, Mary Rodriguez, Marty Rodriguez, Dorothy Malla, Ovide Malla, Helen Meddleton, Debbie Wathogoma, David Jackson, Diane Joens and Doug Bartosh.

The agenda for the meeting is as follows:

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Ryan called the meeting to order at 10:13am
2. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS
3. APPROVE MINUTES FROM 8/17/2011
Director Ward made the motion to approve minutes from 8/17/11. Director Norman seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.
4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Mary Rodriguez stated she is legally blind and requested a copy of the recording of this meeting. She also stated the next Board meeting on October 19th is scheduled for Flagstaff and this will make it difficult for people from Cottonwood to participate. She asked if questions may be asked during the public hearing. Chair Ryan let her know that it is not a discussion forum. It is a time for the Board to hear the public's comments. Mr. Meilbeck confirmed the next meeting is in Flagstaff.

David Jackson, from the Yavapai-Apache Nation, announced their Public Works department has received a transportation grant and the tribe is developing a bus route for the Verde Valley. He is interested in networking with people from other agencies that offer bus service in the area. He understands there may be some cuts in service and the Nation may be able to pick up part of that. It can be a public bus program and it is being reviewed further by their Legal department.

Margaret Frets asked if bus service would be provided to the October 19th Board meeting in Flagstaff. Chair Ryan let her know that NAIPTA does not offer bus service between the communities of Cottonwood and Flagstaff. Mr. Meilbeck responded that bus service to Flagstaff can be considered for the October 19th Board meeting, dependent upon the outcome of this meeting.



Getting you where you want to go



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Flagstaff: 3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928.679.8900 • FAX 928.779.6868 • www.naipta.az.gov
Cottonwood: 340 Happy Jack Way • Cottonwood, AZ 86326 • 928.634.2287 • FAX 928.634.1685

CONSENT ITEMS:

All items on the consent agenda with financial impact have been budgeted.

There are no items for the consent agenda.

DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:

5. APPROVE YAVAPAI FUNDING AGREEMENT FOR CAT SERVICES

-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director

Staff recommends the Board of Directors approve FY2012 Funding Agreement with Yavapai County for provision of Cottonwood Area Transit (CAT) services for FY2012 in the amount of \$22,000.

Heather briefly reviewed the agreement. There were no questions from the Board. Director Norman moved to approve the Yavapai agreement for CAT services. Director Carrigan seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

6. PUBLIC HEARING: POTENTIAL CAT SERVICE CUTS

-Jeff Meilbeck, General Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors hold a Public Hearing regarding possible service reduction of Cottonwood Area Transit (CAT) routes.

Mr. Meilbeck gave a concise and informative PowerPoint presentation. He reviewed NAIPTA's formation and CAT responsibility, success of CAT routes, the need for service reduction, showed the options, provided the public meeting and survey results and noted a possible timeline.

Chair Ryan opened the floor to speakers for the public hearing.

Richard Dehnert, Town of Clarkdale, Vice Mayor, spoke on behalf of the Town of Clarkdale and the Verde Valley Guidance Clinic. He thanked the Board and staff for holding the meeting in Cottonwood. He complimented the NAIPTA staff on examining the options and stating the choices to be made. He stated either Option C or Option D would be satisfactory for the Town of Clarkdale. Many Clarkdale residents use the CAT service to get to their appointments at the Verde Valley Guidance Clinic and they want to preserve that service. Many others use the CAT service for education and employment opportunities. He is glad to have the Verde Lynx service for commuters to Sedona. He recommended pursuing local advertising and reaching out to potential corporate sponsors in the area. He also strongly urged the NAIPTA Board to pursue the possibility of working with the Yavapai-Apache Nation for the future economic sustainability of the system.



Getting you where you want to go



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Flagstaff: 3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928.679.8900 • FAX 928.779.6868 • www.naipta.az.gov
Cottonwood: 340 Happy Jack Way • Cottonwood, AZ 86326 • 928.634.2287 • FAX 928.634.1685

Margaret Paddock spoke on behalf of the Verde Villages residents. She is concerned about the people living off Fir. She is also concerned about cutting the hours of service for those people who use the bus to get to work, school or college. She brings up the idea of monthly passes where NAIPTA would get the money ahead of time and perhaps offer a small discount.

Barbara Ladd spoke on behalf of her family of three. They depend on the CAT ADA transit services as they are visually impaired. They moved to Cottonwood three years ago. Their second greatest reason for them choosing to move to the Cottonwood area was due to CAT and its 20-25 year success. They rely on it for everything. She wanted to emphasize how important the ADA service is in her family's lifestyle.

Jim Jackson felt it would be best to keep the CAT routes the same as they are now. He stated he would rather have a fare increase than have any of the routes be changed because it would hurt a lot of people, including him, especially with regard to the red route. Chair Ryan reminded him that in Mr. Meilbeck's presentation it was stated that a fare increase alone would not solve the problem.

Mary Rodriguez submitted a letter from a citizen who was not able to attend the meeting. She asked to have the letter read into the record. Mr. Meilbeck read the letter from Norma Misewicz. Essentially Ms. Misewicz stated in her letter that she purchased her property 9 years ago because she knew one day she wouldn't be able to drive and she wanted to live where she would be able to ride the bus. She wouldn't mind a small fare increase, but requested to keep CAT service to the Verde Villages. Ms. Rodriguez presented a petition to the Board with 140 signatures. She asked Mr. Meilbeck to read aloud the title and reason for the petition for the record. The petition requested to keep the CAT Stop #25 in service at Western and Pleasant Valley. Next she wanted to address the money issue. She said she has been talking with the City of Cottonwood. She submitted a spreadsheet and asked Mr. Meilbeck to read the document. It was titled, "City of Cottonwood Funding for CAT" referencing revenue and expenses for the period of FY08-FY11. All amounts were read into the record. This document was provided to her by the City of Cottonwood Finance Director, Rudy Rodriguez. Her point was that something is wrong with the figures and she wants to find out what is wrong. She stated that you don't ask a city entity for an extra \$156,000 without a good reason.

Bob Oliphant stated that a \$177,000 shortfall is nothing compared to the city and county budget and he can't believe we are even going through the process for such a small amount of money. His figures are all taken from online budgets and can be checked if anyone cared to do so. He stated the City of Cottonwood has a 15 ½ million dollar budget, some funds are restricted and some are not. He felt like the City of Cottonwood should be paying the \$177,000 to support this project. Mr. Oliphant started talking about slated capital projects for the City of Cottonwood that are subjective with regard to need. Chair Ryan redirected Mr. Oliphant and stated the



Getting you where you want to go



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Flagstaff: 3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928.679.8900 • FAX 928.779.6868 • www.naipta.az.gov
Cottonwood: 340 Happy Jack Way • Cottonwood, AZ 86326 • 928.634.2287 • FAX 928.634.1685

Board decision is related to the budget within NAIPTA. He restated he couldn't understand why the City of Cottonwood was not funding this service.

Vince Lemley, a Clarkdale resident, was called to speak, but he apparently left the premises.

Doug Bartosh, City Manager, City of Cottonwood, spoke on behalf of the City of Cottonwood. Mr. Bartosh reminded everyone this is not necessarily a local budget issue, it is a state budget issue. The state legislature has cut just about all the highway user funds and local transportation assistance funds that used to go to local cities. The City of Cottonwood now has to support CAT through the General Fund. This is the same fund that pays for police, fire and parks and recreation. It has been a struggle. The City looked at ways to become more efficient and cut things back. This is one of those alternatives; a tough decision. In regard to Mr. Oliphant's comments, he stated over 13 million dollars is reserved for capital waste water projects. He stated CAT is really operated more like a business. It does not rely on taxes that come into the City. He supported Jeff, staff and the Board in trying to find a sustainable solution for the CAT system. He favored Option C or Option D as a reasonable solution in tough times, at least until the economy improves and funds return to local governments.

A letter from Ray Serba of Cottonwood was read into the record by James Wagner, NAIPTA Operations Director. Mr. Serba stated he is against changing the CAT routes. He recommended increasing all day passes to \$3.00. He stated the proposed changes to the Blue route would drop service to several areas. He recommended reducing the service area and frequency for the Green and Red routes. He felt use of Cove Parkway should not be traded for sections of the Blue route.

Margaret Frets stated she is not hearing that NAIPTA has gotten in touch with community businesses, banks, the hospital and clinics. She stated we have the statistics of where people are going and when. She felt like we have the presentation and if a lot of people give a little we might get this problem solved.

Chair Ryan declined another comment from Mary Rodriguez.

With no one else coming forth to speak, Chair Ryan closed the public hearing.

Board discussion followed. Director Ward asked if corporate contributions raised could be used to leverage grants. Both Mr. Meilbeck and Ms. Dalmolin agreed this was true. Chair Ryan addressed the need for sustainability and stated it is difficult to rely on one time funding. Mr. Meilbeck stated NAIPTA will initiate an advertising program now so it is established for FY13. Chair Ryan recommended contract agreements with local organizations. Concern was voiced about the area off Fir Street where Verde Village 8 and the elementary school are located not being serviced with the potential route realignment. Mr. Wagner responded that this area has extremely low ridership.



Getting you where you want to go



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Flagstaff: 3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928.679.8900 • FAX 928.779.6868 • www.naipta.az.gov
Cottonwood: 340 Happy Jack Way • Cottonwood, AZ 86326 • 928.634.2287 • FAX 928.634.1685

The petition regarding Stop #25 at Western and Pleasant Valley would be retained under Option C, which has the greatest support. Chair Ryan directed the question presented by Ms. Rodriguez regarding the request for \$156,000 in increased funding from Cottonwood to Mr. Meilbeck. Mr. Meilbeck stated, as he understands it, the City of Cottonwood had that money to pass through from state funds which were eliminated by the state. The funds would now have to come from somewhere else, such as the general fund. Director Ward reminded everyone that the City of Cottonwood had already committed \$257,000 from its general fund for CAT services and it is state funds that are missing. Mr. Meilbeck agreed Director Ward's statement was accurate. Chair Ryan asked about monthly passes. Mr. Meilbeck responded that monthly passes are being considered, but they typically decrease fare box return and are better for the rider. Director Ward asked if the Clarkdale and Yavapai shortfalls in funding CAT were for the same reasons as Cottonwood. Mr. Dehnert, representing the Town of Clarkdale, responded that with a decrease in funds from the state, the council decided to hold the line, so essentially yes. Chair Ryan stated that times are tough, revenues are not coming in and the need is greater which presents challenges. Director Barotz stated there is a shifting of priorities which compounds problems. Chair Ryan explained NAIPTA is a contract agency and with decreased revenue the alternatives have to be considered. Director Barotz asked of the public whom were still in attendance, if they had any unanswered questions. No further questions were asked.

Chair Ryan asked for members of the Board to state their position on this matter. Director Carrigan supported route change Option C. Director Ward supported Option C and stated postponing the decision won't help. Director Norman also supported Option C and noted it should happen sooner than later. Director Barotz stated she had no objection to Option C and asked that choosing a date not preclude approaching corporations for contributions. Mr. Meilbeck responded it would not keep NAIPTA from pursuing corporate sponsors.

Mr. Meilbeck was asked to review each of the alternatives. The Board discussed all of the alternatives. There was some discussion as to whether LTAF funds would be reinstated. There cannot be any action taken on a fare increase at this meeting since it was not a listed agenda item.

Director Ward moved to approve Alternative #1, reducing CAT service as per Option C effective January 3, 2012. Director Carrigan seconded. There was no further discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

Chair Ryan directed staff to prepare staff reports for October to increase fares for the CAT system including projections and for an advertising program including the pursuit of corporate sponsorships.



Getting you where you want to go



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Flagstaff: 3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928.679.8900 • FAX 928.779.6868 • www.naipta.az.gov
Cottonwood: 340 Happy Jack Way • Cottonwood, AZ 86326 • 928.634.2287 • FAX 928.634.1685

Chair Ryan spoke to the audience. He stated times are tough and the hope is to see the CAT system recover.

7. STRATEGIC POLICY RETREAT

-Jeff Meilbeck, General Manager

This item is for discussion only. NAIPTA has conducted an annual Strategic Policy Retreat since 2006 to provide over-arching direction to the organization.

Jeff sent out a request for quotation for vendors to bid on conducting this retreat. Jeff asked for input from the Board as to the availability of members to attend this retreat on December 1st from 9am to 3pm. Director Ward stated earlier is better for him. Director Barotz supported a one day retreat. Director Norman requested not to start until 9am.

PROGRESS REPORTS:

8. GENERAL MANAGER'S PROGRESS REPORT

MOUNTAIN LINK

-Jeff Meilbeck, General Manager

Mr. Meilbeck stated there have been two cover stories and ridership has surpassed our expectations. It is very successful and NAU is very satisfied.

Chair Ryan commented that he has seen buses loaded at Harkins.

9. UPDATED PERSONNEL AND PROCUREMENT POLICIES WITH LEGAL CHANGES

-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director

Ms. Dalmolin stated the mark up changes to the personnel and procurement policies are provided in the agenda packet as the Board requested. The policies are in process now.

10. 2011 TRIENNIAL REVIEW UPDATE

-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director

Ms. Dalmolin reviewed the PDF document outlining due dates for corrective action and noted there are only two items left to close.

ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

11. SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

The next Board meeting is scheduled for October 19th and will be a WebEx meeting based in Flagstaff in the NAIPTA VERA conference room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. October agenda items include: General Fund Policy, Strategic Policy Retreat Update, TAC Amendment to the Rules of Procedure, NAIPTA Annual Performance Report and an Executive Session: GM Evaluation and Contract.



Getting you where you want to go



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Flagstaff: 3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928.679.8900 • FAX 928.779.6868 • www.naipta.az.gov
Cottonwood: 340 Happy Jack Way • Cottonwood, AZ 86326 • 928.634.2287 • FAX 928.634.1685

12. ADJOURNMENT -Chair Ryan adjourned the meeting at 11:50am.

Matt Ryan, Chair NAIPTA Board of Directors

ATTEST:

Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board



Getting you where you want to go